Building Trust With CSR
In Outpatient installation of Dinda Hospital Tangerang

Tuti Ona¹, Mus Aida¹*, Kemala Rita Wahidi¹
¹Master of Hospital Administration Program, Esa Unggul University, Jakarta

This study aims to analyse the significant relationship between PPA competence and hospital facilities to patient loyalty with trust as an intervening variable in the outpatient installation of Dinda Hospital Tangerang, either partially or simultaneously. The research methodology uses a quantitative approach with the path analysis method using the Structural Equation Modelling equation. The sample was taken by using purposive sampling technique. The number of respondents is 100 patients with a minimum visit of 2 (two) times. The results showed that the competence and hospital facilities with trust have a significant relationship together with patient loyalty simultaneously; Competence has a significant positive relationship to trust; Hospital facilities have a significant positive relationship to trust; Competence has a significant positive relationship directly to patient loyalty; Hospital facilities have a positive and significant relationship directly to patient loyalty; Trust has the strongest significant positive relationship to patient loyalty; The relationship between competence and patient loyalty indirectly through the intervening variable trust has a positive relationship and a significant level stronger than directly; and the relationship between hospital facilities and patient loyalty directly has a positive relationship and a significant level stronger than indirectly through the intervening variable trust. The managerial implication of this research is an increase in CSR activities to grow up customer trust.

Keywords: PPA Competency, Hospital Facilities, Trust, CSR, and Loyalty

1. INTRODUCTION
The competition that is getting tougher lately demands a service provider agency to always pamper customers / consumers by providing the best service. Striving to provide health services in a professional and quality manner is a demand for professionalism; and continuous quality improvement forces the hospital to always improve its services in order to increase public trust in the hospital. This trust is very important considering the community as users of its services, so that when trust has been achieved, re-purchases will arise and form customer loyalty. Patient loyalty can be formed from the trust that has been created previously in the patient's mind. This shows that if the patient is loyal, the patient will not move to another hospital. Patient loyalty is the pinnacle of achievement for the hospital service business actors in outpatient installations. A loyal patient will always spread kindness about the quality of health services in the outpatient installation. They have high credibility, because they are not paid by any party to recommend an outpatient installation. They have high credibility, due to they are not paid by any party to recommend an outpatient installation. A loyalty is a deep enduring customer commitment to re-subscribe or make repeat purchases consistently in the future [1]. Patient loyalty is the key to the success of an effort in establishing a long-term relationship between the hospital and its patients. Patient trust is a type of emotional reflection for outpatient health services. It depends on the level of fulfillment of the expected product or service benefits, as well as the level of consistency of expectations and actual results. If the trust of the patient has been established, then the next task of the hospital is to gain and maintain patient loyalty. Patient loyalty is a patient's effort to remain loyal with strong awareness, trust and pride in a health service followed by returning to the hospital for treatment. Consumers will act cooperatively towards trustworthy health services and can commit to recommending them to others. Customer Trust has a positive impact on customer loyalty [2]. This study explains that loyalty is a continuous process as a result of the formation of trust. Intellectual ability and physical ability to competence is the result of intellectual,
technical, commercial and social skills. With the competence possessed by health workers in outpatient installations to establish good relationships with patients, patients will put their trust and commitment to Dinda Hospital and eventually will return to using services at Dinda Hospital in the future. Facilities are everything that is provided by service providers to be used and enjoyed by consumers with the aim of providing the maximum level of satisfaction. Facilities are all things that are physical equipment provided by the service seller to support consumer convenience [3]. Facilities are the appearance, the ability of the infrastructure and the condition of the surrounding environment in showing their existence to the external, which includes physical facilities, equipment and tools. What includes facilities can be in the form of tools, objects, equipment, and workplace space. Based on the report of the Dinda Tangerang Hospital, it shows that outpatient visits in 2019 experienced a significant decrease reaching 3,149 patients or about 6.22 percent compared to 2018. The presence of doctors who came not according to schedule and health workers who were less friendly and responsive were felt not in accordance with patient expectations. at the outpatient installation of Dinda Hospital. Based on the results of the patient satisfaction survey at the outpatient installation in 2019, it shows that the level of satisfaction of health personnel services is 50% which is sufficient and 50% states that they are satisfied. Meanwhile, the results of the patient satisfaction survey for the availability of Dinda Hospital facilities were 50% said it was sufficient and 50% said they were satisfied. On the other hand, Dinda Hospital develops a culture of CSR / Corporate Social Responsibility activities every year to the community to grow up commitment and trust with customers since the inception of the hospital, through mass circumcision activities which are carried out every 3 (three) months by the hospital and free medical treatment for the community, who cannot afford every 2 (two) times in each year. This social activity also involved the participation of several factories and companies around the hospital area. Departing from the data and background regarding the intense competition in hospitals around the location due to the proliferation of health services in Tangerang City, the authors are interested in examining the relationship between PPA competence and hospital facilities on patient loyalty, both direct and indirect effects due to the intervening variable of trust.

2. METHODOLOGY

A. Patient Loyalty

Customer loyalty is the loyalty of parties who use products or services both for their own needs and as an intermediary for the needs of other parties to continue to subscribe to a company in the long run by buying and using products / services repeatedly and voluntarily recommend the company's products and services to its partners [4]. Factors forming the characteristics of consumer loyalty include: interest in regular visits (L1); inter line service (L2) treatment; refer to other people (L3); and refuse to use alternative services offered by other hospitals (L4), respectively [5].

B. Patient Trust

Trust is the ongoing ability to meet consumers and produce positive results in the future [6]. Factors that shape a person's trust are Ability (K1), Benevolence (K2), and Integrity (K3), respectively [7].

C. PPA competency

The ability of individuals to carry out a job correctly and has advantages based on knowledge (P1), skills / Skills (P2), and attitudes / behaviors (P3), respectively [8].

D. Hospital Facilities

Physical facilities on physical environments where services are delivered and where companies and consumers interact, and each tangible component facilitates the appearance or communication of these services. Some factors that influence it are the nature and purpose of service organizations (F1); need for space or space (F2); design of supporting facilities (F3); aesthetics (F4); and the condition of the community and the surrounding environment (F5), respectively [9]. Thus, the conceptual framework in this study is showed in Figure 1.

Based on conceptual framework in this study we suggest the eight hypotheses to obtain the result, as follows:

H0: There is a significant relationship together the PPA competency and hospital facilities to patient loyalty with trust as an intervening variable in the outpatient installation of Dinda Hospital in Tangerang as simultaneously

H1: There is a significant relationship between PPA competency to trust as partially

H2: There is a significant relationship between Hospital Facilities to trust as partially

H3: There is a significant relationship between PPA competency to patient loyalty as partially

H4: There is a significant relationship between hospital facilities to patient loyalty as partially

Figure 1. Conceptual Framework in this study
H₃: There is a significant relationship of trust to patient loyalty as partially
H₄: There is a significant relationship between PPA competency and trust to patient loyalty as partially
H₅: There is a significant relationship between Hospital Facilities and Trust to patient loyalty as partially

The research methodology uses a quantitative approach with the path analysis method using the Structural Equation Modeling equation. The sample was taken by using purposive sampling technique. The sample size in this study was 100 respondents where the sample size was calculated based on the sample size formula [10]. Research respondents were patients who visited the outpatient installation at least 2 visits. The stages of the research method began with secondary data collection in the form of documents and graphic info owned by Dinda Hospital Tangerang and primary data collection in the form of questionnaires and field observation activities. Secondary data and primary data are then developed data processing using descriptive statistics and three box methods. After that, the data was carried out by testing the validity and the Kaiser-Meyer Olkin (KMO) value test, and the reliability test using SPSS software. Data that have validity and reliability values that meet the testing criteria are then developed path analysis using AMOS software to test the significant level of the developed hypothesis. For intervening testing of patient confidence using the Sobel test

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Respondent Characteristic
From the research results, it was found that middle-aged adults reached 52 respondents; Young adults are 39 respondents, and old adults are 9 respondents. The gender of the sample in this study were 63 women and 37 men. The latest education distribution that the respondents had in this study were those who graduated from tertiary education by 28%; graduated from high school by 49%; graduated from junior high school by 14%; and graduated from elementary school by 9%. The distribution of the occupational level of the respondents in this study were students by 1%; private employees by 46%, not working by 35%, self-employed by 15%, and civil servants by 3%. The percentage of the duration of the respondent’s return visits, namely regular return visits of at least 2 times to outpatient installations reached 28% and regular re-visits more than 2 times to outpatient installations reaching 72%. The percentage of parties that bear the cost of examining respondents in this study is BPJS reaching 63%, personal 30%, company guarantee 4%, and insurance 3% (see Table I).

B. Descriptive Statistics
Statistical descriptive results indicate the tendency of respondents in Dinda Tangerang Hospital to be in the perception of being disagreeable until agreeing in responding to the behavior of each statement (see Table II).

C. Three Box Method (Index Analysis)
In order to achieve the result, we have four cluster summaries of respondent statement from patient in Dinda Hospital Tangerang (see Table III).

Based on correspondent data, the summary of the Index Analysis Statement is obtained as follows:

a) There are 3 (three) patient statements from all perceptions that received a low category that needs to be followed comprehensively and is of particular concern from Dinda Tangerang Hospital. The statement includes the availability of adequate parking space for vehicles, the availability of adequate canteen facilities in the hospital, and does not experience obstacles with the presence of community activities that are adjacent to the hospital during the visit.

Table I. Validity and Reliability Testing Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Valid</th>
<th>Not Valid</th>
<th>Cronbach's alpha &gt; 0.6</th>
<th>KMO index &gt; 0.5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Competency</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.640</td>
<td>0.720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital Facilities</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.813</td>
<td>0.836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Trust</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.625</td>
<td>0.781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Loyalty</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.704</td>
<td>0.718</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II. Statistical description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min.</th>
<th>Max.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PPA competency</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital Facilities</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.96</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Trust</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Loyalty</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table III. Summary of respondent statement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Competency</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The behavior of doctors and nurses as a function of communication, function of3828 as, function of facilitors and customers in forming emotional bonds and commitments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital Facilities</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Facilities are everything that physical equipment provided by service sellers to support consumer convenience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Trust</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trust is the ability to refer to comfort, experience, and build communication consistency to form customer loyalty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Loyalty</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Loyalty is a firmly held commitment to repurchase or subscribe to a selected product or service in the future</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

252
This condition can be improved by increasing the parking area of Dinda Tangerang Hospital through asphaltling, roofing / adding roofs in several parts to protect visitors from heat and rain, and adding parking markers for four-wheeled vehicles and two-wheeled vehicles; the development of a canteen that is simple and portable in the room and does not inhibit the movement of patients in the room, and the addition of helper power and road markers that guide the movement of patient vehicles from the small road into the alley to the hospital area when traditional market activities are in a crowded condition.

b) There are 4 (four) statements of patients from all perceptions that result in the behavioral dimensions of health workers having a medium category, namely nurses are very friendly when providing health services, nurses are very polite to provide health services, doctors come on time / on time, and nurses are very responsible for his assignment. This phenomenon can be improved by strengthening ethical training activities and effective communication for nurses in outpatient installations and developing policies / rules related to the mechanism of sanctions / punishments of doctors based on the time of attendance in outpatient polyclinics which are further outlined in the Standard Operating Procedure of Dinda Hospital in Tangerang.

c) The highest statement supporting the dimension of kindness is that hospitals provide services to those who cannot afford medical expenses and hospitals carry out social services to the community.

d) Statements that obtain the highest criteria supporting the dimensions of treatment between service lines are to continue treatment at Dinda Hospital if they experience other health problems.

Based on the Index Criteria Ranking based on the dimensions of all variables, the following results are obtained (see Figure 2).

In this study, Path Diagram serves to see the magnitude of the influence of each variable, both directly and indirectly on patient loyalty in the outpatient installation at Dinda Tangerang Hospital. In testing data using AMOS, the chi-square result is 0.000 it means that the model is close fit or sufficient (see Figure 3).

![Figure 3. Path Diagram](image)

In this study, H1 accepted at AMOS output shows that there is a significant correlation together the competency of health workers and hospital facilities on patient loyalty with trust as an intervening variable in the outpatient installation of Dinda Hospital in Tangerang simultaneously (see Table IV).

Table IV. Summary of path analysis results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables Relationship</th>
<th>Estimate of β</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>C.R.</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Z &lt;- X1</td>
<td>0.316</td>
<td>0.100</td>
<td>3.166</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>H1 Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z &lt;- X2</td>
<td>0.240</td>
<td>0.087</td>
<td>2.750</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>H2 Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y &lt;- Z</td>
<td>0.417</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>3.728</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>H3 Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y &lt;- X1</td>
<td>0.271</td>
<td>0.117</td>
<td>2.324</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td>H4 Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y &lt;- X2</td>
<td>0.246</td>
<td>0.101</td>
<td>2.435</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>H5 Accepted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D. Intervening Testing

Testing mediation hypotheses can be done by a procedure developed is known as a Sobel test. Sobel test is done by testing the strength of the indirect effect of the independent variable (X) on the dependent variable (Y) through the intervening variable (Z), respectively (see Figure 4).

![Figure 4. Sobel Test for the indirect relationship of Competence to patient loyalty through intervening trust](image)

Sobel test statistic: 2.400
One-tailed probability: 0.008
Two-tailed probability: 0.016
The results of the significance level obtained are less than 0.05% with intervening effect on the patient’s trust in mediating the relationship between the PPA competency and patient loyalty. The coefficient value of the indirect effect is 0.132. The total value of PPA competency coefficient as a whole, both the direct and indirect influence on patient loyalty is 0.403 (see Figure 5).

Figure 5. Sobel test for indirect relationship of hospital facilities to patient loyalty through intervening trust

The results of the significance level obtained are less than 0.05. There is an intervening effect of patient trust in mediating the relationship of hospital facilities to patient loyalty. The coefficient value of the indirect effect is 0.100. The total value of the coefficient of overall hospital facilities both direct and indirect influence on patient loyalty is 0.346. The significant correlation together the PPA competency and hospital facilities to patient loyalty with trust as an intervening variable in the outpatient installation of Dinda Tangerang Hospital simultaneously. One factor that influences customer loyalty is trust. Trust arises from a long process until both parties trust each other. If trust is established between the customer and the hospital, then the effort to build it will be easier, the company and customer relations are reflected in the level of trust (trust) of the customers. If the level of customer trust is high, the relationship between the hospital and the customer will be strong. The way that the hospital can do in building relationships with customers, namely all types of health services produced by hospitals must have perfection both through the PPA competency and physical facilities owned by Dinda Tangerang Hospital, as they should or as promised, so that customers do not feel tricked. Therefore, hospitals must be able to provide trust and satisfaction to customers in providing a complete health service, so in this case hospitals must pay attention and improve the function and usefulness of all facilities and resources they have so that hospital visitors can feel comfortable and satisfied. A significant influence together the quality of doctor services and facilities on the satisfaction and loyalty of outpatients in Islamic Hospital Jakarta. Furthermore, a significant relationship between PPA competency to trust. The results of the analysis of the PPA competency variable index obtained an average category of moderate, while for the variable of patient confidence, on average, they obtained the high category. Overall, the statements given by patients in the trust variable show a high category; where social service activities are one form of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) activities held by Dinda Hospital Tangerang, which received the most positive and highest statements by patients visiting outpatient installations. Trust as a person's willingness to be sensitive to the actions of others based on the expectation that other people will perform certain actions on those who believe in them, without depending on their ability to monitor and control them. Competence in the ability (ability) is an aspect of belief which means that someone believes in other people because that person has the appropriate abilities and strengths. The coefficient of direct effect of human resource competence on customer satisfaction is 0.589 which states that human resource competence has a positive and significant effect on customer satisfaction. This means that the better the competence of human resources, the more likely it is to increase customer trust and satisfaction. Thus, a significant relationship between hospital facilities to trust. The results of the analysis of the variable index of hospital facilities were in the medium category, while for the patient loyalty variable, the average category was high. Tangible physical appearance of facilities in servicecape can foster trust in customers so that consumers become satisfied. Servicescape has a significant positive effect on trust and subsequently has a significant positive effect on customer loyalty. A significant relationship between PPA competency to patient loyalty. Here, a result of the analysis of the PPA competency index variable on average were in the moderate category, while for the variable of patient loyalty, on average, they were in the high category. Customers who have highly competent human resources will tend to maintain their loyalty to the company. Customers who get the service they expect will use these experiences to continue business relationships and encourage them to increase business interactions with companies that have high competent human resources. In other words, customers will be loyal to companies with highly competent human resources. A salesperson's competence and service quality have a positive effect on customer loyalty. Here, a significant relationship between hospital facilities to patient loyalty. The results of the analysis of the variable index of hospital facilities were in the medium category, while for the patient loyalty variable, the average category was high. The dimensions of the nature and objectives of the organization, the dimensions of the design of supporting facilities, and the aesthetic dimension of the medium category as well as the dimensions of the need for space or place and the dimensions of the community and the surrounding environment with the low category can contribute positively to the dimensions of interest in visits to regular outpatient installations; dimensions of treatment between lines of medical examination services provided by outpatient installations, dimensions of referencing other people, and dimensions of patients refusing to use alternative outpatient installation services offered by other hospitals in the vicinity of the high category. Facilities are
everything that is physical equipment provided by the service seller to support consumer convenience. The Facility variable has a significant relationship with patient loyalty with 0.315 on positive coefficient value. Thus, a significant relationship of trust to patient loyalty. The statement for the dimension of kindness includes that the hospital still provides services to people who cannot afford the cost of treatment get the high category and the hospital carrying out social service activities in your environment only gets the highest category. The CSR activities developed by the hospital are in the form of social service activities to the community such as free medical services for cleft lip, cataract and circumcision surgery; providing milk and food for malnourished toddlers; and free medical treatment for the poor. The implementation of social service activities to the community is held by the hospital alternately at least 3 (three) times every year. The trust variable has the strongest significant level of patient loyalty compared to the PPA competency variable and the hospital facility variable. Consumers will act cooperatively towards health services that can be trusted and can commit by recommending them to others. The results of research on Customer Trust has a positive impact on customer loyalty. This is because trust will form a reciprocal relationship of very high value. So it can be said that loyalty is a continuous process as a result of the formation of trust. Thus, the trust variable has a positive influence on patient loyalty. Trust variable is the variable that gives the greatest contribution to loyalty. A significant relationship between PPA competency and trust to patient loyalty variable index analysis of the competency of health workers on an average were in the medium category and through the variable of patient confidence in the average category was high, while for the variable of patient loyalty on the average it was in the high category. The competence possessed by doctors and nurses will form a good communication relationship with patients so that it will form an emotional bond between the two. This bond becomes a joint commitment which results in the establishment of loyalty of individual service customers, thereby creating a sense of trust on both sides. The factors that influence customer loyalty to service companies are organizational commitment, competence to form habitual behavior in serving customers, and service satisfaction. Trust is a factor in the formation of commitment. Trust significantly affects commitment in a relationship. Trust is also the belief that one has in a relationship with work partners in relation to being honest and helping one another. Trust can be created when one party feels comfortable making an exchange with another party that is honest and trustworthy. A competency and customer satisfaction variables have a significantly stronger relationship with patient loyalty. Human resource competence is important in achieving customer trust and customer (patient) loyalty at Dinda Hospital Tangerang. Therefore, good competence possessed by doctors and nurses will create customer trust, which after creating customer trust, it is expected that customer loyalty to Dinda Hospital will arise. A significant relationship between hospital facilities and the patient's trust to patient loyalty. The results of the analysis of the variable index of hospital facilities obtained an average category of medium and through the variable of patient confidence in the average category was high, while for the variable of patient loyalty on average it was in the high category. Physical facilities environments where services are delivered and where companies and consumers interact, and each tangible component facilitates the appearance or communication of these services. Physical facilities are immovable objects, real and can be felt by patients such as representative equipment, beautiful building interiors, building exteriors, parking facilities, canteens, bathrooms, and guarantees of safety and comfort. Thus the facilities and infrastructure in the hospital must always be maintained and improved so that patients who visit get a sense of trust and comfort which leads to loyalty or a desire to return to get health services.

4. CONCLUSIONS
The finding in this study is that PPA competence towards patient loyalty indirectly through the intervening variable, patient trust has a positive relationship and a significant level stronger than the direct relationship. Meanwhile, hospital facilities towards patient loyalty have a positive relationship and a significantly stronger level directly than indirectly through patient trust. Good hospital facilities with attention to aspects of patient needs and requests; such as increasing parking lots, providing indoor canteen facilities, and easy accessibility to Dinda Hospital can directly shape patient loyalty. Trust has the strongest significant positive relationship to patient loyalty. PPA competencies and hospital facilities are entry points in building customer trust and loyalty through Corporate Social Responsibility activities which are routinely implemented every year. These CSR activities are able to grow up a sense of trust and loyalty so as to form a strong commitment in customers which in turn creates a sense of patient loyalty. To Increase Dinda Hospital parking lot infrastructure through asphalting, roofing / adding roofs to several parts, and adding vehicle parking location markers; the development of a simple canteen in the room; additional helper power and road markings that guide the movement of patient vehicles to the hospital area; the addition of markers and information boards to facilitate the movement of patients between rooms from the registration room to the outpatient polyclinic; outpatient polyclinic waiting rooms need to be given a television and optimize its function with the aim of families who are waiting for patients while in the room is not saturated and more comfortable; and additional seating in the registration waiting room. Thus, hospital management makes policies / rules related to the mechanism of sanctions / punishments of doctor delays based on the time of attendance as outlined in the Hospital Standard.
Operating Procedure and increases the responsiveness of officers who deal directly with patients by conducting effective and ethical communication training.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We would like to thank dr Mus Aida, MARS and Dr. Kemala Ria Wahidi SKp. Sp.Kep.Onk, ETN for their comments and suggestions regarding the path analysis diagram. We also would like to thank Dr. MF. Arrozi Adhikara, SE, M.Si, Akt, CA and Dr. Rokiah Kusumapradja, MHA for fruitful discussions as well as their support and encouragement.

References

[22] Nguyen, N., & Leblanc, G. (2002). Contact personnel, physical environment and the perceived corporate image of intangible services by new clients, Boston. HBS

Received: 30 June 2020, Accepted: 7 September 2020